



Observatory PASCAL

Place Management, Social Capital and Learning Regions

PURE Regional Visit Report

GABORONE, BOTSWANA

29th – 31ST March, 2009

Mma B Modise, Gabo Ntseane, & Akpovire Oduaran

CDG: Professor Mike Osborne, Professor Catherine Hoppers, Professor Jarl Bengtsson, and Dr Setoi Setoi

RCG: Professor Gabo Ntseane, Professor Akpovire Oduaran, and Dr Mma-B Modise

Individuals Consulted: see Appendix 1

Programme of Meetings: see Appendix 2

Executive Summary

The PURE visit to Gaborone City started with a preliminary evening meeting with senior management and continued over 2 full days (and evenings) with meetings mainly at the University of Botswana that involved a range of stakeholders from UB (including the Deputy VC (Academic Affairs), Department of Adult Education and Faculties of Science and Business), from a private university, business development agencies and the Gaborone City Council (including the Deputy Mayor). The visit was seen as important as a continuation of two previous contacts by the PASCAL co-director, Professor Osborne and PASCAL associate, Professor Longworth that had laid foundations for work in the field of learning city development. A site visit was made to Linkokwing University of Creative Technology in Gaborone.

The visit was arranged very well, and although some expected attendees were not able to be present, much was discussed and much was explained to clarify the purposes of the project.

Discussion was focused around workshops based on four areas of interest - Economic development and innovation, SME Development, Creative and Cultural Enterprises and Environmental Sustainability. In each of these areas examples of interesting practice were identified, and there appeared to be particularly extensive work in the field of sustainable development. In policy terms, UB has very well developed strategies for external engagement and strong support from senior management; these strategies are well-aligned to city development planning. The challenge appears to be the co-ordination of initiatives inside the university to provide a coherent set of deliverables that cross all faculties, mechanisms to determine and create external demand and structures to deliver in a responsive manner.

Areas for consideration are highlighted below and an action plan is proposed for the next year.

Regional Characteristics

Gaborone City is the capital of Botswana with a population of 186, 007 (2001 Population Census) and a population density of Gaborone is 1,000 persons per km². The population of villages in the periphery of Gaborone has experienced rapid growth, more than doubling during the 1991 Census. This development has important policy implications for the city, evidenced by a range of deprivation



Observatory PASCAL

Place Management, Social Capital and Learning Regions

indicators and the affordability of housing. These trends create additional pressure on the provision and distribution of goods and services such as water, food, electricity, sewage, employment, education, health and housing.

Whilst there has been a substantial rise in educational attainment as attested by an increase and diversity in tertiary education in Gaborone, levels of unemployment have increased especially for graduates. There is need to attract sustainable inward investment.

Poverty remains one of the major development challenges of Gaborone City, which is mainly an administrative rather than an industrial city. Agricultural production is limited.

The principal social issue is HIV/AIDS which if not addressed can undermine all development efforts and current achievements. The impacts of HIV/AIDS in the city include the ever-increasing number of orphans, increased expenditure on health and negative impacts on the workforce.

Environmental issues include lack of renewable energy targets, traffic congestion and refuse disposal challenges.

Based on the mandate from the Ministry of Arts and Culture, the city of Gaborone has the responsibility of contributing to the development and promotion of national, regional as well as international cultural ties. This responsibility is critical because one of the major challenges of modernization elsewhere has been that it impacts negatively on the traditional culture of the urban citizens.

Tertiary education consists of the country's only public university, the University of Botswana, established in 1982, Limkokwing University of Creative Technology, an international private university with Malaysian owners, the Botswana College of Agriculture and other tertiary level colleges, including a college offering open and distance learning provision. Following the enactment of the White Paper, Towards a Knowledge Society, by the National Assembly in 2008, a new tertiary education policy is being implemented. . The White Paper stated that the current system of tertiary education had to be reformed for it to meet the social and economic needs and demands of a Botswana that was in transition from a natural resource dependent economy towards a knowledge-based economy. It sets out a series of policy goals and objectives centered on Human Resource Development, and Research and Innovation. The agenda for change also included strategic transformation at Government level, the re-establishment of the Botswana Training Authority and the Tertiary Education Council as part of a Human Resource Development Council, and a new institutional landscape with a governance model based on autonomy and self- management. The key issues to be addressed are:

- Fragmentation of current provision with too many small providers, and the need for an economy of scale.
- A burgeoning private sector, which whilst satisfying demand unfulfilled by the public sector, is perceived to be weakly regulated, of poor quality and high cost.
- The quality and relevance of provision with respect to labour market opportunity.
- Access and participation for 18-24 year olds, which is low, and access in remote geographical areas.
- An institutional climate with poor governance.

The strategic intent is the meeting of the needs of a market-driven, knowledge-based economy, and of satisfying increasing demand with shrinking resources.

Particularly relevant to an agenda of engagement is the espousal of the need to enhance personal aspirations and ambitions beyond the narrowly focused needs of the labour market. The White Paper

speaks of embedding a culture of lifelong learning within tertiary education that meets the multi-faceted needs of individuals, the employment sector and society in general. There is also a challenge laid down for the sector to play a leadership role in knowledge creation and transfer, embedding a culture of research through every facet of life and in developing a national innovation system.

The challenges of policy implication are spelt out in a request for proposals for technical advisers (Technical Education Council 2009, Technical Education Policy Implementation Project, Technical Advisers – Request for Proposals <http://www.universityworldnews.com/filemgmt/visit.php?lid=33>. This brief states inter alia:

- Essentially the White Paper is a perfect example of symbolic policy, strong on the need to break with the past rather than have an immediate short-term impact and less well pronounced in terms of the specifics of how the change will be implemented
- The challenge of symbolic policy is that it inevitably tends to disguise the degree of change that will take place and thus it is only at the point of implementation when the scale of the change that is going to take place it becomes evident.
- As a result, there is the danger that those whose institutional mandates are to be affected by the policy will continue as though the policy did not exist (“it won’t be implemented”) and continue to discharge their mandates

The specific objectives of tertiary education reform are:

- Establishing a Department of Tertiary Education within the Ministry of Education and Skills Development.
- Establishing a Human Resource Development Council which will inter alia absorb the current Botswana Training Authority and Tertiary Education Council as well as including a new function of human resource development planning.
- Re-establishing all public tertiary education institutions, which are currently under the direct control of central government as autonomous corporate service providers.
- Refocusing the academic programmes of the two existing public universities and establishing a new tertiary level institution devoted to Open and Distance Learning.
- Ensuring the private tertiary education institutions are established and developing in accordance with the provisions of the tertiary education policy.

The White Paper’s aspirations provide both challenges and opportunities for the higher education providers. It offers a clear legitimacy to a policy of external engagement with a range of stakeholders in order that not only supply and demand in the labour market are better matched, but also that individuals and organizations with a range of situational barriers are provided with personal and organization development and lifelong learning opportunities and improved equity of access.

At a local level in Gaborone of particular relevance are the aspirations of the city. These are crystallized in the Review of Gaborone City Development Plan (1997-2021): Draft Final Development plan, which is just about to be made public. The plan has 13 principal goals and a vision for Gaborone City of 2021 that is summarized in a 6-part vision statement:

Observatory PASCAL

Place Management, Social Capital and Learning Regions

1. Gaborone will be a well planned city
2. Gaborone will be a caring city
3. Gaborone will be an economically vibrant and sustainable city
4. Gaborone will be a well managed and run city
5. Gaborone will be an environmentally friendly and sustainable city
6. The City will preserve its cultural and historic heritage

Areas of priority in Regional Engagement

The proposed priority areas are as follows:

- Economic development and innovation
- SME Development
- Creative and Cultural Enterprises
- Environmental Sustainability

Responses to global financial crisis

In the RBP, UB reports that the economic crunch that every nation is experiencing has negatively impacted its ability to meet many of its obligations to its community in terms of rendering valuable services. In their own words, 'we have financial limitations'.

Interim findings and advice

Our interim findings from the visit to Gaborone suggest a number of positive elements in place that will support engagement between higher education and the city. A strong infrastructure within the University of Botswana and a commitment at the highest level to external engagement is manifest in its Strategic Plan to 2016 and beyond, A Strategy for Excellence. Priority Area 4 is Strengthening Engagement, and has the goal of empowering all parts of the university to engage in social and economic development, business and enterprise, commercialization and knowledge transfer, community development and the arts, culture and heritage and the creation of sustainable environments. Goals and objectives are matched by detailed outcomes with a set of indicators to be benchmarked against comparable institutions. There are of course resource issues to be addressed, and structural considerations in order that the impressive ambition of the strategy is achieved. A number of risks and ways in which they may be mitigated are presented. Strategy documents have been produced or are in production for four key areas, of which that on Arts and Culture was made available to the CDG during the review. Others in the areas of Economic development and innovation, SME Development and Environmental Sustainability are being produced.

In our meetings at UB, it seemed at first sight that the risk highlighted in the strategy that some academic areas might not be interested was a reality. Despite a number of faculties being invited and a clear understanding by the co-coordinating department, Adult Education, of importance of broad coverage we met only one Dean. However, this may not have been lack of interest, but a competing event, Also the lead department may need more authority to bring all faculties to the table. Very positively, once academics are brought into discussions, they do become engaged with engagement and see the relevance. This was evident in the responses of the Dean of Science, the Head of Environmental Science and Head of the Business Clinic. They did not know in detail how PURE would be relevant to them, but after only a short involvement in discussion they saw precisely their potential roles. The message perhaps is that paperwork is no substitute for discussion, and continuous and repeated discussions will be needed with a range of internal stakeholders.

Externally a range of stakeholders was identified and many attended. Importantly the Deputy Mayor attended the opening session, and was able to identify two key areas of the city's priorities,



Observatory PASCAL

Place Management, Social Capital and Learning Regions

environmental degradation and land use, as matters that clearly came within the remit of PURE. Two officials from the city in the area of Planning were present throughout the review and made a number of interventions. Another official from Youth Affairs was present on day 1. Whilst others within the City Council had been invited and could not attend, there are clear lines of communication that can be used to create structures that could form the basis for further discussion in smaller groups in the future. Other stakeholders present included CEDA (Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency) and the Limkokwing University of Creative Technology. Absent (but with invitations) were other important stakeholders including the Tertiary Education Council, the Botswana Innovation Hub, the Botswana College of Agriculture and LEA (Local Enterprise Authority). However the local co-ordinating group is aware of the importance of including these players, and during the course of the visit it became evidence that others beyond these organizations may have a role (e.g. National Museum and Art Gallery) and that the group itself should expand to include multiple players. As with internal stakeholders within UB, the main obstacles to partnership are the legitimization of the initiative and the existence of structures that will allow dialogue, leading ultimately to implementation of agreed goals. High level sign-off is needed, and the support of the V-C and DVC (AA) of UB and the Deputy Mayor as evidenced in the meetings they attended indicates that relatively small steps can be made to progress matters.

In four focused sessions, we explored the forms that current engagement of UB in particular, and also of Limkokwing, take. A number of examples of individual initiatives exist, which demonstrate a willingness to engage that exists across faculties and the two providers. Some examples are noted below. However, these occur in isolation and are not part of an integrated strategy. The challenge for the future will be to ensure that there is some coherence within the espoused strategy for engagement within UB and structures to facilitate links with multiple players within the city not only improving supply, but also responding to demand and creating new demand. It is evident that some stakeholders within the city are looking for rapid response, and appreciate a 'can do' approach. It was notable in discussions that the LUCT representatives tended to take such an approach within the parameters of their offer, and this perhaps reflects a flatter management structure. Governance structures within UB may need to be developed in order to free champions who can work across faculties, and feel empowered to make commitments to engagement. A cross-faculty steering committee concerned with engagement might be set up, and the rewards systems for engagement as signaled in the Strategic Plan might be enacted. It was suggested that a series of focused retreats might be organized to cohere work in this area.

Opportunity certainly exists and the visit was timely since the City's draft development plan only became available during our time in Gaborone. For example in the arts and culture area, many possibilities arose; these include engagement as a means of contributing to the evocation of a cultural consciousness, the marketing of cultural assets and the development of cultural industries. Cultural processes can be a source of innovation across all disciplines. There are pockets of possibility at UB that depend on individuals, and a strong basis for collaboration with the city. In particular the city representatives spoke of Gaborone as a 'silent city' – there is little visibility of its history, its culture or its industry and the university could advise on these matters. However, whilst UB's strategy document for Arts and Culture engagement may be well-crafted, from the perspective of the city, they as a stakeholder have not been involved. Limkokwing spoke of its links with the Botswana Society of Arts, its assistance in raising funds for an Arts Centre, and its wish to promote Gaborone as a City of Arts and Culture in co-operation with others. Given a space the LUCT offered to provide a historical display.

An alignment of the external engagement work of the tertiary education sector to a number of detailed goals enunciated in the development plan creates clear opportunities for the tertiary education sector in Gaborone. The plan contains many of the regional data sets that can be used as a backdrop to this alignment, much of which has been missing previously. Since a number of UB staff (e.g. Dept of Architecture) were consulted in the course of creating the plan and students



Observatory PASCAL

Place Management, Social Capital and Learning Regions

served internships in the city, there is already a strong basis for building upon existing links, and in so doing demonstrate that the university is in the words of the DVC (AA) a 'good citizen'. However it was interesting to note that this and other engagements were not necessarily well-known. One external stakeholder for example said that they only knew that there was a university in Gaborone when students were on strike, and little documentation about what it did was made public. Yet CEDA commented that the economic expertise that UB holds could be very useful to it. And representatives of the City Council commented that there were not enough public presentations of UB's work and those public lectures on hot topics were not publicized well. In short the plea is that knowledge should be made more accessible, and that specialist capacity needs to be better aligned to needs. Where student internships exist they are in limited areas and these could be broadened and deepened.

In the area of business development and entrepreneurship, CEDA reported that there was a need for specific rather than general training for existing and would-be micro business. The level of this training is lower than that generally offered by universities and in the form of smaller chunks. The adult education arm of UB could respond to these needs, but in order for this to happen, closer links with CEDA and LEA are needed.

In the area of environment and sustainability, discussion centred around three main issues: direct links with external agencies; modelling of universities' own environmental behaviours; and adaption of the curriculum to embed practices of sustainability. The UB Department of Environmental Science reported that despite there being no formal programme or reporting mechanism that many links with government departments and the city exist. It had set up Somarelang Tikologo (Environmental Watch) as an NGO to engage with the city in areas including waste management, landfill and creation of 'green money' through re-cycling. It had contributed to the Greater Vision for Gaborone, making the city more appealing by re-habilitating two spaces – a local community park and an eco-park. The Department had also contributed to the integration of legislation. Other projects mentioned included water harvesting with schools and trailing of solar energy devices in family homes.

It seemed that not full advantage had been taken of all opportunities in the environmental field. For example it was suggested that UB through its participation in the Botswana Innovation Hub could enhance solar energy work by incubating SMEs making the technology. In the case of the city park with its organic garden and recycling schemes, there was agreement that it was not well publicized, and that the educational component could be enhanced. There are also opportunities in the area of bio-diversity based on the City Development Plan.

Most important for UB perhaps is ensuring that alignment of its strategy for engagement is linked with the city's development plan in the context of learning city development, building on its own earlier discussions with Gaborone City taken forward during an earlier visit by PASCAL Associate, Norman Longworth. The PURE initiative can be seen as an important tool that assists the process, and providing a means of achieving one important part of the already understood concept of developing the learning city. We also heard comments from city representatives such as the university should be the 'torch-bearer of civil society', and the important role of intellectuals in beating the recession. There was also a hope amongst city officials that the universities could help in developing the identity of Gaborone as a major destination in southern Africa.

Possible specialist sub-group cluster subjects (and possible partner regions)

Economic development and innovation, SME Development, Creative and Cultural Enterprises and Environmental Sustainability all remain at the end of the first visit as possible areas for focus. This may be reduced following further consultation. It is already event following the involvement of Professor Ntseane in the Lesotho review that regular exchanges between the two African regions



Observatory PASCAL

Place Management, Social Capital and Learning Regions

would be useful. It can be envisaged that links with any region where skills development, creativity and culture or environmental sustainability is to the fore would be likely.

We discussed the possibility of long term twinning in the future between the city and other regions

Possible examples of good practice that may be written up later

Placement of UB architecture and planning students in City Council to make contributions to City's Development Plan

UB Business Clinic that

- Places students in SMEs.
- Aids with company registration processes.
- Helps prepare business plans.
- Has a road show to cultivate entrepreneurship.
- Runs tailor-made outreach programmes for groups of SMEs.

UB's Department of Environmental Science and Somarelang Tikologo (Environmental Watch) and the variety environmental projects that it has been engaged in, including

- City and eco-park development.
- Schools projects in water harvesting.
- Household Solar energy trials.

Linkokwing's embedding of contribution to the city in undergraduate programmes – including contribution to design of bus shelters and in development of parks

Initial use of and reactions to the Benchmarking Tools

Generally the reaction to the tools was positive although the HEI tool appeared daunting. It would be used selectively with different sections being used with different parts of the university. It was felt to be a useful starting point for discussion and analysis. Feedback would be given on the Regions tool.

First indicative notes about a Region Action Plan

1. The LP, Professor Ntseane would seek to broaden the local RCG.
2. The focus of PURE would be honed down to three areas - SMMEs, culture and environmental sustainability.
3. The HEI Benchmarking tool would be used to engage a broader range of departments and an overall synthesis of engagements would be produced.
4. A number of online meetings between the RCG and the CDG would be held over the next 10 months to review progress.
5. The region would be clustered with other regions with common interests to share and begin exchanging progress.
6. The next CDG visit would probably be in February 2010.



Observatory PASCAL

Place Management, Social Capital and Learning Regions

7. Professor Youngman would discuss with Professor John Briggs, Glasgow Centre for International Development (GCID) when he visits in May, the possibility of allocating one of three endowed PhD studentships at Glasgow for UB staff to PURE.
8. The 2010 conference would be held in Botswana provisionally on 1/2 December 2010 with the PURE workshop on 3 December. There would be a social programme on 20 September and a reception co-hosted by UB and the city. A steering committee would be set up by UB with two members of PASCAL involved. The provisional title would be Engaged Universities and Learning City-Regions.



Observatory PASCAL

Place Management, Social Capital and Learning Regions

Appendix 1: Individuals Consulted

NAME	ORGANIZATION	EMAIL/PHONE
Shelter Sheleni	Citizen Empowerment Development Agency (CEDA)	Ssheleni@ceda.co.bw
Lesego Marope	PY01(G.C.C)	lesh1994@yahoo.com
Kagiso Seloma	Limkokwing University	Kseloma@gmail.com
Motsoptse Modisi	U.B Faculty of Science	modisi@mopipi.ub.bw
Roy Mafunga	Gaborone .City .Council	roymafunga@gmail.com
Timothy Lim	Limkokwing University	timothy.lim@Malaysia-innovation.com
M K Chen	Limkokwing University	mk.meng@gmail.com
Prof Frank Youngman	UB -Deputy Vice Chancellor Academic DVC (AA)	dvcaa@mopipi.ub.bw
Prof Gabo Ntseane	UB (Head) Department of Adult Education	ntseanep@mopipi.ub.bw
Monnamasole M	Gaborone City Council (Physical planner)	allenbaeti@yahoo.com
Keneilwe Molosi	UB. (Adult Education Department)	Molosi@mopipi.ub.bw
Cosmos Maretele	Social &Community Development Depart	3191281
E.D.M Odirile	Faculty of Business (Business Clinic)	edmo@mopipi.ub.bw 3555111/3552992
Dr Lekoko	UB. (Adult Education Department)	3552065
Ms Thobega	UB. (Adult Education Department)	3552068
Prof Maruatona	UB. (Adult Education Department)	3552067
	Deputy Mayor	
	Local Enterprise Authority	
Dr. Segosebe	Department of Environmental Science	

Appendix 2: Programme of Meetings

March 28 th	6.30pm	Welcomes of Pure CDG at the Falcon Crest by LP.
March 29 th	Morning and all Day	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ CDG meets over breakfast from 8.30am, and studies relevant documentation to prepare for the review, followed by social events. ▪ Meeting with RCG members, VC, DVC AA) followed by dinner
	6.00pm	
March 30 th	8.30 – 9.30 am 10.00 -12.30 12. 30 PM 2.00 – 3.00 PM 3.30 – 5.00pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ DAE steering group meeting ▪ Stakeholder workshop ▪ LUNCH ▪ Economic development and innovation group meeting ▪ SME Development group meeting ▪ Dinner with CDG
	6.00 pm	
March 31 st	8.00 – 8.30 8.00 -10.00am 10.30 – 12-30 12.45 -1.45 pm 2.00 – 3.30 pm 3.30 -5.00 pm 7.00 pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Meeting with Students ▪ Creative and cultural enterprises group meeting ▪ Environmental sustainability group meeting ▪ LUNCH ▪ CDG private meeting ▪ Debriefing with CDG ▪ Dinner with DVC (AA)